In the current policy debate over privacy, the protection of personal information is often set against the benefits society is expected to gain from large scale analytics applied to individuals' data. An implicit assumption underlies the purported dichotomy between privacy and "big data": it is assumed that research in economics overwhelmingly concludes that the increasing collection and analysis of personal data will be economically beneficial for data holders and data subjects alike. I will use results from theoretical and empirical economics to investigate that notion. In doing so, I will highlight how current research findings paint a more nuanced picture of the economic impact of data sharing and data protection on both individual and societal welfare. Then, I will use results from behavioral economics and decision research to investigate the role of individuals' privacy decision making in affecting their economic welfare.